

Professional Obligations and Human Rights

2

14

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

252627

28

1

INTRODUCTION

- 4 The fiduciary nature of the physician-patient relationship requires that physicians act in their patients'
- 5 best interests. In doing so, physicians must strive to create and foster an environment in which the
- 6 rights, autonomy, dignity and diversity of all patients, or those seeking to become patients, are
- 7 respected. This goal is achieved, in part, by fulfilling the obligations under the Ontario Human Rights
- 8 Code¹ (the "Code"), which entitles every Ontario resident to equitable treatment with respect to
- 9 services, including health services.
- 10 This policy articulates physicians' professional and legal obligations to provide health services without
- discrimination. This includes a duty to accommodate individuals who may face barriers to accessing
- care. The policy also sets out the College's expectations for physicians who limit the health services they
- 13 provide due to clinical competence or because of their personal values and beliefs.

PRINCIPLES

- 15 The key values of professionalism articulated in the College's <u>Practice Guide</u> compassion, service,
- altruism and trustworthiness form the basis for the expectations set out in this policy. Physicians
- 17 embody these values and uphold the reputation of the profession by, among other things:
 - Acting in the best interests of their patients, and ensuring that all patients, or those seeking to become patients, receive equitable access to care. This is especially important with respect to vulnerable and/or marginalized populations;
 - Communicating effectively and respectfully with patients, or those seeking to become patients, in a manner that supports their autonomy in decision-making, and ensures they are informed about their medical care;
 - 3. Properly managing conflicts, especially where the physician's values differ from those of their patients, or those seeking to become patients. The patient's best interests must remain paramount;
 - 4. Participating in self-regulation of the medical profession by complying with the expectations set out in this policy.

-

¹ Human Rights Code, RSO 1990, c H.19.



PURPOSE

29

35

36

51

52

53 54

55 56 57

- 30 This policy sets out the legal obligations under the Code for physicians to provide health services without
- 31 discrimination, as well as the College's professional and ethical expectations of physicians in meeting
- 32 those obligations. This policy also sets out physicians' duty to accommodate individuals who may face
- 33 barriers to accessing care. Finally, this policy outlines physicians' rights to limit the health services they
- 34 provide for legitimate reasons while upholding their fiduciary duty to their patients.

POLICY

Human Rights, Discrimination and Access to Care

- 37 The Code articulates the right of every Ontario resident to receive equitable treatment with respect to
- 38 services, goods and facilities, without discrimination on the grounds of race, ancestry, place of origin,
- 39 colour, ethnic origin, citizenship, creed, sex, sexual orientation, gender identity, gender expression, age,
- 40 marital status, family status or disability.² The *Code* requires that all those who provide services in
- 41 Ontario, including physicians providing health services, do so free from discrimination.
- 42 Discrimination may be described as an act, decision or communication that results in the unfair
- 43 treatment of a person or group by either imposing a burden on them, or denying them a right, privilege,
- 44 benefit or opportunity enjoyed by others. Discrimination may be direct and intentional. Alternatively,
- 45 discrimination may be entirely unintentional, where rules, practices or procedures appear neutral, but
- 46 may have the effect of disadvantaging certain groups of people. The Code provides protection from all
- 47 forms of discrimination based on the above protected grounds, whether intentional or unintentional.³
- 48 Physicians must comply with the *Code*, and the expectations of the College, when making any decision
- relating to the provision of health services. This means that physicians cannot discriminate, either
- directly or indirectly, based on a protected ground under the *Code* when, for example:
 - Accepting or refusing individuals as patients;
 - Providing existing patients with healthcare or services;
 - Providing information or referrals to existing patients or those seeking to become patients;
 and/or
 - Ending the physician-patient relationship.

The Duty to Accommodate

The legal, professional and ethical obligation to provide services free from discrimination includes a duty

- to accommodate. Accommodation is a fundamental and integral part of providing fair treatment to
- 60 patients. The duty to accommodate reflects the fact that each person has different needs and requires
- different solutions to gain equitable access to care.

_

² Human Rights Code, RSO 1990, c H.19, s 1.

³ As adapted from the Human Rights Commission of Ontario's definition of 'discrimination'.

- 62 The Code requires physicians to take reasonable steps to accommodate the needs of existing patients,
- or those seeking to become patients, where a disability⁴ or other personal circumstance may impede or
- 64 limit their access to care. The purpose in doing so is to eliminate or reduce any barriers or obstacles that
- 65 they may experience.
- The College expects physicians to comply with their duty to accommodate as set out in the Code, and to
- 67 make accommodations in a manner that is respectful of the dignity, autonomy and privacy of the
- 68 person.
- 69
- 70 Examples of accommodation may include: enabling access for those with mobility limitations, permitting
- a guide dog to accompany a patient into the examination room, ensuring that patients with hearing
- 72 impairment can be assisted by a sign-language interpreter, being considerate of older patients that may
- 73 face unique communication barriers, and/or providing reasonable flexibility around scheduling
- 74 appointments where patients have family-related needs.⁵
- 75 While physicians have a legal, professional and ethical duty to accommodate, there are limits to this
- 76 duty. Physicians do not have to accommodate beyond the point of undue hardship, where excessive
- 77 cost or health or safety concerns would result. The duty to accommodate is also limited where it
- 78 significantly interferes with the legal rights of others.⁶

Limiting Health Services for Legitimate Reasons

79 80 81

82 83

84

85

The duty to refrain from discrimination does not prevent physicians from limiting the health services they provide for legitimate reasons.⁷ Physicians, for instance, may be unable to provide care that is clinically indicated and within the standard of care, if that care is outside of their clinical competence. Also, physicians may be unwilling to provide care that is contrary to their moral or religious beliefs.

(e) an injury or disability for which benefits were claimed or received under the insurance plan established under the *Workplace Safety and Insurance Act*, 1997.

⁴ Section 1 of the *Human Rights Code*, RSO 1990, c H.19 defines "disability" as follows:

⁽a) any degree of physical disability, infirmity, malformation or disfigurement that is caused by bodily injury, birth defect or illness and, without limiting the generality of the foregoing, includes diabetes mellitus, epilepsy, a brain injury, any degree of paralysis, amputation, lack of physical co-ordination, blindness or visual impediment, deafness or hearing impediment, muteness or speech impediment, or physical reliance on a guide dog or other animal or on a wheelchair or other remedial appliance or device, (b) a condition of mental impairment or a developmental disability,

⁽c) a learning disability, or a dysfunction in one or more of the processes involved in understanding or using symbols or spoken language,

⁽d) a mental disorder, or

⁵ Ontario Human Rights Commission, *Submission Regarding College of Physicians and Surgeons Policy Review: Physicians and the Ontario Human Rights Code,* (Ontario: August 1, 2014).

⁶ Further explanation of 'undue hardship' is provided in the Human Rights Commission's *Policy and Guidelines on Disability and the Duty to Accommodate*.

⁷ For more information see the College's <u>Accepting New Patients</u> and <u>Ending the Physician-Patient Relationship</u> policies.

While physicians may limit the health services they provide as discussed below, they must do so in a manner that respects patient dignity and autonomy, upholds their fiduciary duty to the patient, and does not impede equitable access to care for existing patients, or those seeking to become patients.

The following sections set out physicians' rights and obligations in these circumstances.

i) Clinical Competence

The duty to refrain from discrimination does not prevent physicians from making decisions in the course of practicing medicine that are related to their own clinical competence. Physicians are expected to provide patients with quality health care in a safe manner. If physicians feel they cannot appropriately meet the health care needs of an existing patient, or those who wish to become patients, they are not required to provide that specific health service or to accept that person as a patient. However, physicians must comply with the *Code*, and College expectations, in so doing. Any decision to limit health services provided on the basis of clinical competence must be made in good faith.

Where clinical competence may restrict the type of services or treatments provided, or the type of patients a physician is able to accept, the College requires physicians to inform patients of this as soon as is reasonable. The College expects physicians to communicate this information in a clear and straightforward manner to ensure that individuals or patients understand that their decision is based on an actual lack of clinical competence rather than discriminatory bias or prejudice. This will lessen the likelihood of misunderstandings.

In order to protect patients' best interests and to ensure that existing patients, or those seeking to become patients, are not abandoned, the College requires physicians to provide a referral to another appropriate health care provider for the elements of care the physician is unable to manage directly.

ii) Moral or Religious Beliefs

- The Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms (the "Charter") protects the right to freedom of conscience and religion. Although physicians have this freedom under the Charter, the Supreme Court of Canada has determined that no rights are absolute. The right to freedom of conscience and religion can be limited, as necessary, to protect public safety, order, health, morals, or the fundamental rights and freedoms of others.
- 118 Where physicians choose to limit the health services they provide for moral or religious reasons, this
 119 may impede access to care resulting in a violation of patient rights under the *Charter* and the *Code*.
 120 The courts have determined that there is no hierarchy of rights; all rights are of equal importance.
 121 Should a conflict arise, the aim of the courts is to respect the importance of both sets of rights to the extent possible.

⁸ Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, Part I of the Constitution Act, 1982, being Schedule B to the Canada Act 1982 (UK), 1982, c 11, s 2(a).

⁹ R. v Big M Drug Mart Ltd., [1985] 1 SCR 295 at para 95.

¹⁰ R. v Morgentaler, [1988] 1 SCR 30 at pp 58-61, and see also the Code.

¹¹ Dagenais v Canadian Broadcasting Corp., [1994] 3 SCR 835 at p 839.

The balancing of rights must be done in context.¹² In relation to freedom of religion specifically, courts will consider how directly the act in question interferes with a sincerely held religious belief. Courts will seek to determine whether the act interferes with the religious belief in a manner that is more than trivial or insubstantial. The less direct the impact on a religious belief, the less likely courts are to find that freedom of religion is infringed.¹³ Conduct that would potentially cause harm to and interfere with the rights of others would not automatically be protected.¹⁴

While the *Charter* entitles physicians to limit the health services they provide on moral or religious grounds, this cannot impede, either directly or indirectly, access to care for existing patients, or those seeking to become patients. Therefore, the College requires physicians who choose to limit the health services they provide on moral or religious grounds to do so in a manner that:

- i. Respects patient dignity;
- ii. Ensures access to care; and
- iii. Protects patient safety.

136137

138139

140

129

130

131132

133

134

i. Respecting Patient Dignity

Where physicians are unwilling to provide certain elements of care due to their moral or religious beliefs, physicians must communicate their objection directly and with sensitivity to existing patients, or those seeking to become patients, and inform them that the objection is due to personal and not clinical reasons.

141142143

144

145146

147

In the course of communicating their objection, physicians must not express personal judgments about the beliefs, lifestyle, identity or characteristics of existing patients, or those seeking to become patients. This includes not refusing or delaying treatment because the physician believes the patient's own actions have contributed to their condition. Furthermore, physicians must not promote their own religious beliefs when interacting with patients, or those seeking to become patients, nor attempt to convert them.

148 149

150 ii. Ensuring Access to Care

151 152

153

Physicians must provide information about all clinical options that may be available or appropriate to meet patients' clinical needs or concerns. Physicians must not withhold information about the existence of a procedure or treatment because the procedure conflicts with their religious or moral beliefs.

154155156

157

158

159

Where physicians are unwilling to provide certain elements of care due to their moral or religious beliefs, an effective referral to another health care provider must be provided to the patient. An effective referral means a referral made in good faith, to a non-objecting, available, and accessible physician or other health-care provider. The referral must be made in a timely manner to reduce the

¹² Ontario Human Rights Commission, *Policy on Competing Human Rights*, (Ontario: Jan 26, 2012).

¹³ Syndicat Northcrest v Amselem, [2004]2 SCR 551 at paras 59-61.

¹⁴ Syndicat Northcrest v Amselem, [2004] 2 SCR 551 at para 62.

¹⁵ In the hospital setting, referral practices may vary in accordance with hospital policies and procedures.



risk of adverse clinical outcomes. Physicians must not impede access to care for existing patients, or those seeking to become patients.

The College expects physicians to proactively maintain an effective referral plan for the frequently requested services they are unwilling to provide.

166 iii. Protecting Patient Safety

167168169

160 161

162

163164

165

Physicians must provide care that is urgent or otherwise necessary to prevent imminent harm, suffering, and/or deterioration, even where that care conflicts with their religious or moral beliefs.¹⁶



¹⁶ This expectation is consistent with the College's <u>Providing Physician Services during Job Actions</u> policy. For further information specific to providing care in health emergencies, please see the College's <u>Physicians and Health Emergencies</u> policy.